

EXHIBIT 1

March 1, 2024 Email re Muster Rolls

From: [Mirsky, Sara J. \(CIV\)](#)
To: [Kevin Dean](#); [J Edward Bell](#); [Zina Bash](#); [Matthew D. Quinn](#)
Cc: [Lipscomb, Bridget \(CIV\)](#); [Bain, Adam \(CIV\)](#); [Turner, Joseph B. \(CIV\)](#); [Ryan, Patrick J. \(CIV\)](#); [Adams, Jennifer E \(CIV\)](#); [Hurt, Cindy M. \(CIV\)](#)
Subject: RE: CLJA - ATSDR Muster Roll Database Usage
Date: Friday, March 1, 2024 4:57:15 PM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)

Kevin,

To be very clear, based upon the United States' inquiries, the only potential location of the digitized muster rolls and any associated database from the 2013-15 digitization project is in the materials we are providing to you this month from the NAS at Quantico. We understand that Plaintiffs' inference from the 2014 and 2015 VA/DoD Reports is that there is some other database where a search can be run by name, or perhaps in batches. We are aware of no such database. As we have relayed to Plaintiffs multiple times, the 2013-15 digitization project created a database intended to assist the VA with one-off searches for corroborating evidence when the VA had other information regarding a veteran's service information (such as unit number). Neither the VA nor ATSDR possessed this database or the related files. The only surviving iteration of the legacy system created from the 2013-15 digitization project is on the NAS at Quantico, and we are producing those files to Plaintiffs.

While Dr. Bove may have been aware of digitization efforts, that does not mean he utilized the resulting database in the way you are describing. As Dr. Bove stated in the excerpt from the September 11, 2014 CAP meeting you provided, "The Marine Corps is digitizing the muster rolls, **but it's not going to be a computerized database. It's going to be something we have to search each person individually.** And it's based on a lot of microfiche and other poor quality documents. **And so they're not sure how good this database is going to be. I shouldn't call it a database,** a searchable whatever you want to call it. I guess you could call it a database. **So there are issues about trying to expand the Marine cohort. And the group felt that we really don't need to.**" (emphasis added). In line with this, and because of the functional limitations of the database, Dr. Bove relied on the DMDC data for his work.

Accordingly, the United States will not agree to any informal discussion between Plaintiffs and ATSDR employee Dr. Bove.

Please let us know if you would like to discuss any of this further.

Thank you,
Sara



Sara J. Mirsky
Trial Attorney
Environmental Torts Litigation
U.S. Department of Justice
202.616.8362 (Office)
202.451.7726 (Mobile)
sara.j.mirsky@usdoj.gov

This email and any attachments may contain information that is privileged, confidential, or otherwise protected from disclosure under applicable law. If the reader of this transmission is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution, copying, or use of this transmission or its contents is strictly prohibited. If you have received this transmission in error, please notify the sender immediately and delete or destroy the original transmission and any copies (electronic or paper).

From: Kevin Dean <kdean@belllegalgroup.com>

Sent: Thursday, February 29, 2024 11:11 AM

To: Mirsky, Sara J. (CIV) <Sara.J.Mirsky@usdoj.gov>; J Edward Bell <jeb@belllegalgroup.com>; Zina Bash <zina.bash@kellerpostman.com>; Matthew D. Quinn <MatthewQuinn@lewis-roberts.com>

Cc: Lipscomb, Bridget (CIV) <Bridget.Lipscomb@usdoj.gov>; Bain, Adam (CIV) <Adam.Bain@usdoj.gov>; Turner, Joseph B. (CIV) <Joseph.B.Turner@usdoj.gov>; Ryan, Patrick J. (CIV) <Patrick.J.Ryan@usdoj.gov>; Adams, Jennifer E (CIV) <Jennifer.E.Adams@usdoj.gov>; Hurt, Cindy M. (CIV) <Cindy.M.Hurt@usdoj.gov>

Subject: [EXTERNAL] Re: CLJA - ATSDR Muster Roll Database Usage

Sara, thank you for this information update, but let me clarify the facts as we know them and what we had requested you informally inquire of Dr. Bove, which seems to have been lost in translation.

While it is true Dr. Bove did not rely upon the Muster Rolls in any of his health studies, it was **not** because he was unaware of them. It is clear from a review of the CAP meeting transcripts from 2013 to 2016 (excerpts attached for your ease of reference) that:

- Dr. Bove and the other expert members of the panel were aware of the muster roll;
- Dr. Bove was exploring the use of the muster rolls to expand the cohort population from 1975-1985 to 1971-1985;
- Dr. Bove was aware of the USMC muster roll digitization project and kept up to date with its progress;
- Dr. Bove was aware the project was completed between 12/2015 and 8/2016; and
- Dr. Bove was aware the muster roll data would be “available for researchers and the Marines and probably the VA at some point in the near future.”

The plaintiffs’ interest in the muster rolls is not related Dr. Bove’s health studies, but rather for the simple fact the digitized muster rolls represents the only digital data source available for Camp Lejeune clients who were on the base prior to July of 1975. Having access to this database would expedite the confirmation process of these clients and mostly eliminate the need for a client specific file review. This ability is beneficial to the Bellwether process but will be especially important for any type of settlement matrix where exposure data is a required data point. Having this data will allow bulk processing of pre-July 1975 Camp Lejeune clients to determine the exposure period and location on base. The location on base is determined through the unit code which is one of the data fields provided with the muster rolls. All efforts

we have been referred to on this topic in the past, have met with incomplete information, a different database not what we were asking for, or incomplete answer to the question posed like expressed herein.

Would you allow us to get on an informal phone call with Dr. Bove and yourself, so I can discuss this topic with him and see if he can help locate their source location within the governments databases?

Thank you,

Kevin R. Dean
Member, Motley Rice LLC
Operating today at Bell Legal Group through Secure Email Server
Cell: 843-834-1130
Get [Outlook for iOS](#)

From: Mirsky, Sara J. (CIV) <Sara.J.Mirsky@usdoj.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, February 28, 2024 1:22:57 PM
To: J Edward Bell <jeb@belllegalgroup.com>; Zina Bash <zina.bash@kellerpostman.com>; Kevin Dean <kdean@belllegalgroup.com>; Matthew D. Quinn <MatthewQuinn@lewis-roberts.com>
Cc: Lipscomb, Bridget (CIV) <Bridget.Lipscomb@usdoj.gov>; Bain, Adam (CIV) <Adam.Bain@usdoj.gov>; Turner, Joseph B. (CIV) <Joseph.B.Turner@usdoj.gov>; Ryan, Patrick J. (CIV) <Patrick.J.Ryan@usdoj.gov>; Adams, Jennifer E (CIV) <Jennifer.E.Adams@usdoj.gov>; Hurt, Cindy M. (CIV) <Cindy.M.Hurt@usdoj.gov>
Subject: CLJA - ATSDR Muster Roll Database Usage

All,

Per Plaintiffs' request, ATSDR has asked Dr. Bove whether he utilized the USMC's digitized muster roll database in relation to his work on the Camp Lejeune health studies. Dr. Bove stated that ATSDR relied on the Defense Manpower Data Center (DMDC) data for the health studies, not the muster roll database. The DMDC data has already been produced in this litigation.

Thanks,
Sara



Sara J. Mirsky
Trial Attorney
Environmental Torts Litigation
U.S. Department of Justice
202.616.8362 (Office)
202.451.7726 (Mobile)
sara.j.mirsky@usdoj.gov

This email and any attachments may contain information that is privileged, confidential, or otherwise protected from disclosure under applicable law. If the reader of this transmission is not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution, copying, or use of this transmission or its contents is strictly prohibited. If you have received this transmission in error, please notify the sender immediately and delete or destroy the original transmission and any copies (electronic or paper).